



**Trafford Libraries**

**Post Consultation Report**

**February 2013**

## Table of Contents

1.0 Introduction.....	3
2.0 Purpose and scope of the public consultation.....	4
3.0 Methodology.....	4
4.0 Consultation Feedback.....	5
4.1 Response Rate.....	5
4.2 Public Consultation.....	5
4.3 Staff Consultation.....	6
4.4 Breakdown by Equality Streams.....	6
5.0 Proposal 1 - Use of volunteers.....	9
5.1 Proposal.....	9
5.2 Proposed Savings.....	9
5.3 Background.....	9
5.4 Consultation responses / submissions.....	10
5.5 Trafford Councils response and recommendation.....	13
6.0 Proposal 2 - Transfer Greatstone Library to the Town Hall.....	14
6.1 Proposal.....	14
6.2 Background.....	14
6.3 Consultation Responses/Submission.....	15
6.4 Trafford Council's Response and Recommendation.....	16
7.0 Any Other Comments.....	17
8.0 Recommendations Summary.....	18
8.1 Options and Recommendations.....	18
8.2 Cost Benefit of Recommendations.....	18
9.0 Conclusion.....	18
10.0 Appendices.....	19
Appendix A: Questionnaire.....	19
Appendix B: Overview of Equality Impact Assessments.....	21

## 1.0 Introduction

- 1.1 This paper reports on the outcomes of the Libraries public consultation and provides options and recommendations for the Councils Executive to consider.
- 1.2 Trafford Library Service provides a number of services from 14 libraries across the Borough. There were more than 1,100,000 visits to Trafford libraries last year and over 850,000 books were issued

In previous public consultation, residents have said that they wanted to see volunteers used to help deliver Council services and the Library Service was frequently mentioned as one of those where volunteers could help out.

During the current difficult financial climate, as a result of lower levels of funding, Trafford Library Service has had to reduce costs and one way that this has been achieved without closing libraries or reducing opening hours has been by introducing volunteers into Hale and Old Trafford libraries, supporting the loan of books.

This has proved to be a real success in both Old Trafford and Hale Libraries. Hale in particular has been over subscribed for volunteers (over 30 have come forward).

Following the success of this approach and in order to avoid closing any libraries or reducing opening hours, it was proposed to extend the use of volunteers across all libraries.

We also proposed to move Greatstone library in Stretford Leisure Centre into the refurbished Town Hall which will improve the service available to customers.

The proposals were outlined in a consultation titled Looking Forward, Options for the future of Trafford Libraries.

- 1.3 Trafford Council undertook an extensive public consultation on the proposals contained within Looking Forward, Options for the future of Trafford Libraries..

The 12 week public consultation period ran from October 22<sup>nd</sup> 2012 until January 14<sup>th</sup> 2013.

It was undertaken through the following formats:

- A letter and consultation document was sent to every active user of Greatstone library

- A consultation document was available in hard copy, primarily in libraries

- A questionnaire was available on-line

- 1.4 A total of 700 questionnaires were sent directly to active users of Greatstone library. In total, the Consultation received 399 responses from the public.
- 1.5 Equality Impact Assessment documents were prepared to accompany each of the recommendations associated with the Consultation.

- 1.6 Consultation with staff was also undertaken. The staff consultation was part of Trafford's wider consultation with all staff potentially affected by various budget proposals. The formal consultation period for staff started on 15<sup>th</sup> October 2012 and concluded on 14<sup>th</sup> January 2012. In total, the Consultation received 66 responses from the public.
- 1.7 The key outcomes to the proposals from the Public and Staff Consultations are shown for each proposal within this report.
- 1.8 The responses received and views expressed during the consultation have been carefully considered and taken into account in the recommendations to deliver a comprehensive and efficient library service.

## **2.0 Purpose and scope of the public consultation**

- 2.1 The purpose of the Libraries public consultation was to engage people who live, work or study in Trafford in understanding and providing feedback on the proposed changes to the way in which library services are delivered in the Borough.
- 2.2 The public consultation took place over 12 weeks (22<sup>nd</sup> October 2012 – 14<sup>th</sup> January 2013) and its purpose was to investigate public opinion on the following proposals:

To use volunteers across all libraries  
Transfer Greatstone Library to the Town Hall

In addition respondents could add further comments on the library service

## **3.0 Methodology**

- 3.1 Access Trafford Libraries outlined various proposals to meet the required savings as part of the wider Council spending challenge. The service entered into a 12 week public consultation period on 22<sup>nd</sup> October 2012 and this concluded on 14<sup>th</sup> January 2013.
- 3.2 A wide range of approaches were used to capture public response to the Library Review:

A letter outlining the proposals and a copy of Looking Forward was sent to 700 active users of Greatstone library

All consultation documentation including the questionnaire was available on Trafford Councils website <http://www.trafford.gov.uk/librariesconsultation>

An email address was provided for any requests for information.

The questionnaire 'Looking Forward' outlined both proposals and asked for feedback on each one. In addition people could give general feedback about library services

Hard copy of all the documentation was available at all Trafford Libraries and other Council buildings

Alternative formats and languages of background documentation were available on request

The Staff consultation on the proposals ran for 13 weeks from 15<sup>th</sup> October 2012 until 14th January 2014. Staff accessed this via the Access Trafford pages on the Intranet

Discussions with Trafford Leisure Trust because of Greatstone library being located in Stretford Leisure Centres

- 3.3 A phone number and text link was also provided to enable people to discuss the proposals should they wish to.
- 3.4 There were no requests to hold a public meeting as part of the consultation

## **4.0 Consultation Feedback**

### **4.1 Response Rate**

The 'Looking Forward' questionnaire was made available on the Trafford Council web site throughout the consultation period and printed copies were available at all libraries and on request. Over 700 copies were posted to active users of Greatstone library.

The public could also email any questions they had to a specific email address which was checked daily. There was also a phone number in case people wanted to talk about the proposals.

399 public responses to the 'Looking Forward' consultation were received.

### **4.2 Public Consultation**

People were asked to give their view on each proposal and provide additional comments. There was also the opportunity to give more general comments. These views and number of comments are shown in Fig 1 below.

Answer Given	Use Volunteers across all libraries		Transfer Greatstone Library to the Town Hall		Any Other Comments
	Views	Comments	Views	Comments	
<b>Strongly support</b>	56 15%	16	55 15.1%	11	8
<b>Tend to support</b>	77 20.6%	44	56 15.3%	25	19
<b>No views either way</b>	25 6.7%	4	107 29.3%	7	4
<b>Tend to oppose</b>	54 14.4%	38	29 7.9%	18	14
<b>Strongly oppose</b>	151 40.4%	96	65 17.8%	50	48
<b>Don't know</b>	11 2.9%	8	53 14.5%	5	5
		206		116	98

Fig 1 Public Response to Proposals Overview (Volume of answers, % and number of comments)

### 4.3 Staff Consultation

All Access Trafford staff were given the opportunity to comment on the proposals via a questionnaire on the Access Trafford intranet.

A total of 66 submissions were received with 118 separate comments on the proposals. This is covered in more detail in a Staff Consultation Report.

### 4.4 Breakdown by Equality Streams

Those who responded to the questionnaire were asked to provide equalities profile information. Where available the information from the 2001 Census has been included to show how representative the respondents were. The results are below:

#### 4.4.1 Libraries used

Respondents were asked which libraries they used, in some cases people used more than one library hence the overall percentage is greater than 100%.

Libraries Used		
Altrincham	92	23.2%
Bowfell	16	4%
Coppice	36	9.1%
Davyhulme	59	14.9%
Greatstone	45	11.4%
Hale	46	11.6%
Lostock	12	3%
Old Trafford	23	5.8%
Partington	23	5.8%
Sale	90	22.7%
Stretford	85	21.5%
Timperley	44	11.1%
Urmston	147	37.1%
Woodsend	50	12.6%
Home Library Service	2	.5%
Talking Book Service	3	.8%
Non Trafford	35	8.8%
None	2	.5%

Fig 2 Which Library do you use?

#### 4.4.2 Gender

Stating gender was not a requirement of the consultation and 22.8% failed to provide this information.

The response was greater from females than males and the proportion was greater than shown in the 2001 Census. However, this does reflect library usage as more females use libraries than males.

Gender			% of Stated	2001 Census
Male	109	27.3%	35.4%	49%
Female	199	49.8%	64.6%	51%
Not Stated	91	22.8%		

Fig 3 What is your gender?

#### 4.4.3 Disabilities

Stating a disability was not a requirement of the consultation and 13% failed to provide this information.

The response of 13.5% stating a disability is slightly below the 18% of the 2001 Census.

\*Please note, as some customers have more than 1 disability the individual disabilities add up to more than the disability total.

Disabilities			% of Stated	2001 Census
Mobility (getting around)	32	8%	9.2%*	
Using hands/fingers	6	1.5%	1.7%*	
Hearing	14	3.5%	4%*	
Eyesight	11	2.7%	3.2%*	
Learning	0	0%	0%*	
Any Disability	47	11.8%	13.5%	18%
None	300	75.2%	86.5%	82%
Not Stated	52	13%		

Fig 4 Do you have a disability?

#### 4.4.4 Ethnicity

Stating ethnicity was not a requirement of the consultation, however only 11.5% failed to provide this information.

The response of 10.8% stating an ethnic origin other than white British is more than the 8.4% of the 2001 Census.

Ethnicity			% of Stated	2001 Census
White British	315	78.9%	89.2%	91.6%
Other White Background	10	2.5%	2.8%	8.4%
Asian/Asian British	8	2%	2.3%	
Black/African/Caribbean/Black British	7	1.7%	2%	
Chinese	2	.5%	.6%	
Mixed ethnic origin	5	1.2%	1.4%	
Other origin	6	1.5%	1.7%	
Not Stated	46	11.5%		

Fig 5 Ethnicity of Users

#### 4.4.5 Age

Stating age was not a requirement of the consultation, however only 6.7% failed to provide this information.

The 65+ age group are over represented compared to the 2001 Census and the under 16 age group are under represented. This could be due to parents completing the consultation on behalf of the family.

Age			% of Stated	2001 Census
Under 16	7	1.7%	1.9%	20%
16-24	7	1.7%	1.9%	64%
25-44	115	28.8%	30.9%	
45-64	135	33.8%	36.3%	
65+	108	27%	29%	16%
Not Stated	27	6.7%		

Fig 6 Age of Users



## 5.0 Proposal 1 – Use of volunteers in all libraries

### 5.1 Proposal

**The proposal is to extend the use of volunteers across all libraries to support the book lending element of the Library Service.**

Access to Council Services in libraries would still be provided by Customer Service Advisors in the same way that we do at Hale and Old Trafford.

We propose to train and introduce volunteers in all of our libraries on a phased basis.

We do not intend to make any staff redundant with volunteers introduced as they are trained and as staff leave through natural turnover.

We would provide an additional trainer to ensure volunteers were properly trained.

We would seek the following number of volunteers at each library.

<b>Library</b>	<b>Number of volunteers required</b>
Altrincham	10
Coppice	10
Davyhulme	5
Lostock	5
Partington	5
Sale	15
Stretford	10
Timperley	15
Urmston	15
Woodsend	5
<b>Total</b>	<b>95</b>

Fig 7 Proposed number of volunteers

### 5.2 Proposed Savings

The saving associated with the proposal was £73,653 in the first year and £116,326 in the second year. The saving takes into account the cost of an additional trainer to train volunteers.

### 5.3 Background

Earlier this year we introduced volunteers at Hale and Old Trafford libraries to assist in the running of the book lending service. Sufficient Customer Service Advisor (CSA) roles were retained at Hale Library and Old Trafford Library to support volunteers and deliver other Council Services.

The Council still support the libraries with staff and management and by buying and maintaining the stock, maintaining the buildings and providing training volunteers. Volunteers maintain the book lending part of the library service and activities, thereby enabling the libraries to remain open.

Trafford staff are still be available to deal with Council enquiries such as council tax and benefits, waste and recycling, blue car badges and pest control.

Hale library soon became oversubscribed for volunteers and there is currently a waiting list of 10. A successful launch event was held at Hale Library on 5 July 2012.

There are now 12 volunteers helping at Old Trafford library. A volunteer at Old Trafford library has successfully applied for a staff role as a Customer Service Advisor in the Library Service. This demonstrates the opportunity for a route to employment offered by volunteering. Another volunteer has taken the initiative to promote Asian fiction in Old Trafford library

## 5.4 Consultation Responses / Submissions

### 5.4.1 Public

Fig 8 below shows the answers given to the proposal to use of volunteers across all libraries. This is split by the volume and % of support for the proposal and shows the number of additional comments received and their categorisation e.g. supportive / unsupportive and the % of responses:

	<b>Response Count</b>	<b>Response %</b>	<b>Additional Comments</b>
<b>Strongly Support</b>	56	15%	11
<b>Tend to support</b>	77	20.6%	25
<b>No views either way</b>	25	6.7%	7
<b>Tend to oppose</b>	54	14.4%	18
<b>Strongly oppose</b>	151	40.4%	50
<b>Don't know</b>	11	2.9%	8
<b>Skipped the question</b>	25		
<b>Total responses</b>	399		

Fig 8 Use of volunteers across all libraries response count and % of responses.

Of the 374 responses to this proposal 35.6% were either strongly supportive or tended to support the proposal and 54.8% strongly opposed or tended to oppose the proposal. The overall result from the public was that they were on balance not supportive of this proposal.

During the consultation 49 people have indicated that they would consider becoming a volunteer at the Libraries.

Fig 9 below shows the number of results split by the library used.

<b>Comment Categorisation</b>	<b>Strongly Support</b>	<b>Tend to Support</b>	<b>No Views Either Way</b>	<b>Tend to Oppose</b>	<b>Strongly Oppose</b>	<b>Don't Know</b>	<b>Totals</b>

<b>Altrincham</b>	19	21	4	13	27	4	88
<b>Bowfell</b>	0	3	0	1	9	1	14
<b>Coppice</b>	7	6	1	7	13	0	34
<b>Davyhulme</b>	4	18	4	7	18	4	55
<b>Greatstone</b>	3	11	2	10	17	1	44
<b>Hale</b>	13	8	2	4	15	2	44
<b>Lostock</b>	1	2	1	1	5	1	11
<b>Home Library</b>	1	0	0	0	0	0	1
<b>Outside Trafford</b>	6	9	2	4	10	1	32
<b>Old Trafford</b>	6	3	1	4	8	0	22
<b>Partington</b>	2	3	4	1	10	1	21
<b>Sale</b>	11	16	3	11	40	2	83
<b>Stretford</b>	9	16	6	9	39	2	81
<b>Timperley</b>	7	14	3	6	11	1	42
<b>Urmston</b>	7	27	8	19	74	3	138
<b>Woodsend</b>	1	10	3	12	18	0	44
<b>Totals</b>	97	167	44	109	314	23	754
<b>Total that answered the question</b>	56	77	25	53	150	11	372

Fig 9 Breakdown of support by library used by number of respondents

As can be seen in Figs 10 above, the opposition to the proposal is higher at Urmston.

As well as an objective question residents were able to provide additional comments. There were 213 comments and they have been grouped and answered as follows;

Number of comments	Theme of comment	Council response
95	Volunteers are detrimental to the service and professionalism	Staff will be retained to answer customer service enquiries and

		volunteers will be trained. This has not been an issue in either Hale or Old Trafford where volunteers are already in place
39	Volunteers are good if they keep libraries open	The basis for proposing the use of volunteers was to keep all of the libraries open
24	Concern over staff redundancies	No front line staff will be made redundant and volunteers will only be used where staff have left
24	Ok if an addition to staff and no staff redundancies	There will always be a member of staff in a Library to answer customer enquiries and no front line staff will be made redundant
20	Other	The responses given could not be grouped
9	Volunteers are unreliable	It is accepted that volunteers are unlikely to be as reliable as paid staff but this has not been an issue in either Hale or Old Trafford libraries
5	Find savings in other ways eg raise council tax	The Executive is not minded to raise Council Tax and alternatives to using volunteers were also proposed and rejected as this would have meant closing libraries as some other authorities have done.

Fig 10 Additional respondent comments

#### 5.4.2 Staff

The majority of staff (69%) were against the proposal.

Do you agree with the proposal	Response Count	Response %
Yes	13	22.4%
No	40	69%
Don't know	5	8.6%

Fig 11 Staff Response

### 5.5 Trafford Council's Response and Recommendation

#### 5.5.1 Options

**Option 1** - Continue with the proposals as outlined in the consultation document i.e. extend the use of volunteers across all Trafford libraries

**Option 2** – Maintain 1 additional Customer Service Adviser in Urmston.

**Option 3** - Maintain 1 additional Customer Service Adviser in Urmston and transfer a further .5 Customer Service Adviser from Sale to Urmston library.

**Option 4** – No changes to current operational model

### 5.5.2 Recommendation

Prior to this consultation all options for saving money in the Library service were considered and the only alternative to extending the use of volunteers was to close some libraries.

In light of the results of the consultation it is recommended that changes are made to the proposal for the number of staff retained at Urmston library. Whilst opposition has been expressed in relation to the proposals, the Executive should also be mindful of the following factors in reaching a decision:

- I. The successful experience of using volunteers in Hale and old Trafford
- II. The support from 35.6% of residents in relation to the proposals to use volunteers in all libraries
- III. The 49 residents who have indicated an interest in volunteering in libraries as a part of the consultation
- IV. The significant financial pressure facing the Council and the need to make savings whilst also seeking to protect front line services
- V. Alternative options undertaken by other local authorities including the closure of libraries
- VI. Service to residents will not be reduced

It is therefore recommended that **Option 3** be pursued, this would result in an additional 1.5 Customer Service Advisers being available in Urmston. This option takes into account the consultation feedback and concerns raised over the level of concern from users of Urmston library.

The cost of this option will be covered from disestablishing a vacant Customer service Adviser post from elsewhere in Access Trafford

In addition the Council will work in collaboration with the Citizens Advice Bureau (CAB) to provide a Video Link from Old Trafford library and one other, possibly Coppice, in 2013. The CAB has secured Lottery funding for this pilot. This will be used to pilot the technology and assess its usability and customer acceptance.

This will mitigate the potential issue of a member of staff not being available or able to answer a customer enquiry.

### 5.5.3 Savings

The initial proposal provided a saving target of £189,979 and the revised proposal will deliver the same saving.

### 5.5.4 Equality Impact Assessment

An initial Equality Impact Assessment was carried out prior to the consultation and a more detailed EIA has been carried out on the recommendation. This can be found in Appendix B.

### **5.5.5 Mitigation**

A detailed plan will be confirmed for how volunteers will be recruited, trained and phased in over the next 2 years.

The Council will work in collaboration with the Citizens Advice Bureau (CAB) to provide a Video Link from Old Trafford library and one other, possibly Coppice, in 2013. The CAB has secured Lottery funding for this pilot. This will be used to pilot the technology and assess its usability and customer acceptance.

### **5.5.6 Implementation**

Should the recommended approach be approved a detailed plan for how volunteers will be recruited, trained and phased in will be prepared. Those who have expressed an interest in volunteering through the consultation will be contacted to confirm their interest.

## **6.0 Proposal 2 – Transfer Greatstone Library to the Town Hall**

### **6.1 Proposal**

**The proposal is to transfer the Library in Stretford Leisure Centre (Greatstone Library) to the Town Hall**

Moving the service to the Town Hall will provide customers with an improved service that will include access to Customer Service Advisors (none are currently present at Greatstone) who can answer any customer enquiries.

The Town Hall is less than 500 metres from the Leisure Centre so should cause no disruption for customers who use the library there.

### **6.2 Background**

Greatstone Library is a small self service library located within Stretford Leisure Centre. Of those customers that use Greatstone library 40% also visit another library.

The refurbished Town Hall opens in the spring of 2013 and will include an area for a small lending library.

### **6.3 Consultation Responses/ Submissions**

### 6.3.1 Public

Fig 12 below shows the answers given to the proposal to transfer Greatstone library to the Town Hall. This is split by the volume and % of support for the proposal and shows the number of additional comments received and their categorisation e.g. supportive / unsupportive and the % of responses:

	<b>Response Count</b>	<b>Response %</b>	<b>Additional Comments</b>
<b>Strongly Support</b>	55	15.1%	11
<b>Tend to support</b>	56	15.3%	25
<b>No views either way</b>	107	29.3%	7
<b>Tend to oppose</b>	29	7.9%	18
<b>Strongly oppose</b>	65	17.8%	50
<b>Don't know</b>	53	14.5%	5
<b>Skipped the question</b>	34		
<b>Total responses</b>	399		

Fig 12 Transfer Greatstone library to the Town Hall. Response count and % of responses.

Of the 365 responses to this proposal 30.4% were either strongly supportive or tended to support the proposal and 25.7% strongly opposed or tended to oppose the proposal. The overall result from the public was that they were supportive of this proposal.

As well as an objective question residents were able to provide additional comments. There were 120 comments and they have been grouped and answered as follows;

Number of comments	Theme of comment	Council response
48	Disagreed that the library should	Whilst there were more

	transfer to the Town Hall	comments against moving the library most respondents to the question were in favour of the proposal
23	Agreed that the library should transfer to the Town Hall	This supports the proposal
21	Didn't know enough about the library and didn't use Greatstone	There are no amendments to the proposal as most comments were from residents who did not use Greatstone Library
17	Other	The responses given could not be grouped
9	Agreed that the library should transfer to the Town Hall but with some reservations	This supports the proposal
3	Close Greatstone or another library	Closing libraries was rejected

Fig 13 Additional respondent comments

### 6.3.2 Staff

The majority of staff were in favour of the proposal to transfer the library from Greatstone to the Town Hall

Do you agree with the proposal	Response Count	Response %
Yes	49	83.1%
No	4	6.8%
Don't know	6	10.2%

Fig 14 Staff Response

## 6.4 Trafford Council's Response and Recommendation

### 6.4.1 Options

**Option 1** - Transfer the library from Greatstone to the Town Hall

**Option 2** - Retain Greatstone library

### 6.4.2 Recommendation

In light of the results of the consultation it is recommended that **Option 1** is progressed and the Greatstone library service is transferred from Stretford Leisure Centre to the Town Hall as soon as possible.

### 6.4.3 Savings

The proposed saving of £4,874 will be delivered

### 6.4.4 Equality Impact Assessment



An initial Equality Impact Assessment was carried out prior to the consultation and a more detailed EIA has been carried out on the recommendation. An overview of the Equality Impact Assessment can be found in Appendix B.

#### **6.4.5 Mitigation**

Arrangements will be made to offer the Home Library service to any applicable customers who cannot access the Town Hall

#### **6.4.6 Implementation**

The service will be transferred to the Town hall as soon as possible after the refurbished Town hall reopens.

### **7.0 Any Other Comments**

A section was included in the consultation questionnaire that gave respondents an opportunity to add any other comments. In total 102 additional comments were made. The following headings cover the theme of most comments.

#### **7.1 Retain professional staff**

This was a theme from the consultation last year and was addressed by retaining additional staff in Hale and Old Trafford libraries. As the same model is being used for all other libraries the concern is mitigated.

#### **7.2 Heart of the community**

The current proposals ensure that all Trafford libraries remain open and 95% of residents are within 1 mile of their local library and 99% within 2 miles.

#### **7.3 Libraries should not close**

The recommendation ensures that no library will close.

#### **7.4 Volunteers should not replace staff**

The recommendation is that volunteers will be phased in and no front line staff will be made redundant as a result of the proposals

#### **7.5 Access to other services**

The recommendation ensures that sufficient staff will be available to deliver other Council services.

## 8.0 Recommendations Summary

### 8.1 Options and Recommendations

The responses received and views expressed during the consultation have been carefully considered and taken into account in the recommendations to deliver a comprehensive and efficient service within the libraries.

The following table shows the options and recommendations for the Library Consultation:

Proposal	Options	Recommendation
<b>P1.</b> Use volunteers in all libraries	<p><b>Option 1</b> - Continue with the proposals as outlined in the consultation document i.e. extend the use of volunteers across all Trafford libraries</p> <p><b>Option 2</b> – Maintain 1 additional Customer Service Adviser in Urmston.</p> <p><b>Option 3</b> - Maintain 1 additional Customer Service Adviser in Urmston and transfer a further .5 Customer Service Adviser from Sale to Urmston library.</p> <p><b>Option 4</b> – No changes to current operational model</p>	<b>Option 3</b> – Continue with the proposal to implement volunteers in all libraries but maintain 1 additional Customer Service Adviser in Urmston and transfer a further .5 Customer Service Adviser from Sale to Urmston library.
<b>P2.</b> Transfer Greatstone library to the Town Hall	<p><b>Option 1</b> – Transfer Greatstone Library to the Town Hall</p> <p><b>Option 2</b> – Retain Greatstone library</p>	<b>Option 1</b> - Transfer the library from Greatstone to the Town Hall as soon as it reopens

Fig 15 Summary of Options

### 8.2 Cost Benefit of Recommendations

The following table shows that there are no changes to the original savings based on the changes made in the proposals outlined in 8.1

Proposal	2013/14 Consultation Report Saving	Proposed Saving
1. Use volunteers in all libraries	£189,979	£189,979
2. Transfer Greatstone library to the Town Hall	£4,874	£4,874
<b>Totals</b>	<b>£194,853</b>	<b>£194,853</b>

Fig 16 Cost Benefit of Recommendations

## 9.0 Conclusion

To conclude, it is recommended that the Council Executive reviews and approves the preferred options highlighted in this report.

# 10.0 Appendices

## Appendix A: Consultation Document



  
**TRAFFORD COUNCIL**

---

## INTRODUCTION

Trafford Library Service provides a number of services from 14 libraries across the Borough. There were more than 1,100,000 visits to Trafford libraries last year and over 850,000 books were issued.

In previous public consultation, residents have said that they wanted to see volunteers used to help deliver Council services and the Library Service was frequently mentioned as one of those where volunteers could help out.

During the current difficult financial climate, as a result of lower levels of funding, Trafford Library Service has had to reduce costs and one way that this has been achieved without closing libraries or reducing opening hours has been by introducing volunteers into Hale and Old Trafford libraries, supporting the loan of books.


This has proved to be a real success in both Old Trafford and Hale Libraries. Hale in particular has been over subscribed for volunteers (over 30 have come forward).

Following the success of this approach and in order to avoid closing any libraries or reducing opening hours, we intend to extend the use of volunteers across all libraries.

We also intend to move the library in Stretford Leisure Centre into the refurbished Town Hall which will improve the service available to customers.

The options are described in more detail below followed by a questionnaire where we would welcome your views.

2

  
**TRAFFORD COUNCIL**

---

## IMPROVEMENTS TO SERVICES

A major improvement this year has been the introduction of eBooks, available from the Trafford Libraries website. We have also made a number of eBook Readers available to loan for anyone who cannot afford an eBook Reader or those who want to 'try before they buy.'

We have also removed the charge for the loan of audio books.

Over the next few months we will be working to implement a new library management system across all libraries. This will deliver an improved service and a financial saving as well as the opportunity for future development with other Greater Manchester Councils.

**Proposals**

The proposal in each area is highlighted in **bold**.



4

1.

### Extend the use of volunteers across all libraries

Earlier this year we introduced volunteers at Hale and Old Trafford libraries to assist in the running of the book lending service. Sufficient Customer Service Advisor (CSA) roles were retained at Hale Library and Old Trafford Library to support volunteers and deliver other Council Services.

**The proposal is to extend the use of volunteers across all libraries to support the book lending element of the Library Service.**

Access to Council Services in libraries would still be provided by Customer Service Advisors in the same way that we do at Hale and Old Trafford.

We propose to train and introduce volunteers in all of our libraries on a phased basis.

We do not intend to make any staff redundant with volunteers introduced as they are trained and as staff leave through natural turnover.

We would seek the following number of volunteers at each library.

Library	Number of volunteers required
Altrincham	10
Coppice	10
Davyhulme	5
Lostock	5
Partington	5
Sale	15
Stretford	10
Timperley	15
Urmston	15
Woodhend	5
<b>Total</b>	<b>95</b>

Table 1

5

# Appendix A: Consultation Document

**CONSULTATION**

**8. It would help if you could provide some basic information about yourself.**

Male
  Female  
 Under 16
  16-24
  25-44
  45-64
  65+

Your postcode

**Do you have a disability?**

No
  Using hands/ fingers  
 Eyesight
  Mobility (getting around)  
 Hearing
  Learning

**Which best describes your ethnic background?**

White British
  Black/African/Caribbean/Black British  
 Asian/Asian British
  Chinese  
 Other White background
  Mixed ethnic origin  
 Other origin

**9. Would you be interested in volunteering in libraries?**

**If so please give your details below.**


Name

Address

Email

Which Library you would like to volunteer in?

10

  
**TRAFFORD COUNCIL**

## CONSULTATION

Please answer the questions below and provide any comments you have on the proposals outlined. The consultation will run from Monday 22nd October 2012 and closes on Monday 14th January 2013.

You can also access this questionnaire online at [www.trafford.gov.uk/librariesconsultation](http://www.trafford.gov.uk/librariesconsultation). Alternatively you can hand it in to any Trafford Library or return to: Access Trafford Consultation, Sale Waterside, Sale M33 7ZF

**1. Which library or library service do you use? Please tick all that apply**

Altrincham
  Old Trafford  
 Bowfell
  Partington  
 Coppice
  Sale  
 Davyhulme
  Stretford  
 Greatstone
  Timperley  
 Hale
  Urmston  
 Lostock
  Woodsend  
 Home Library Service
  Talking Book Service  
 A library outside Trafford
  None

7

**CONSULTATION**

**2. If you don't use a library please could you tell us why**

**3. How often do you use a library?**

Every day
  Once a month  
 More than once a week
  Once every few months  
 Once a week
  Less often

**4. Why do you use a library? Please tick all that apply**

Borrow/ return books
  Find information  
 Borrow/ return DVDs
  Local/ family history  
 Borrow/return audio books
  Learning activity  
 Use computers
  Children's events (Rhymetimes)  
 Council services (blue car badge etc)
  Adult events (reading groups etc)  
 Study/research
  Do homework

**5. Have you ever used our online services? Please tick all that apply**

Online renewals
  Local groups & Societies  
 Online reservations
  Trafford Lifetimes (Local history)  
 Online catalogue
  Recommend stock  
 Book a PC
  Online reference sources  
 Sign up for email notification
  Joined online

8

**6. Please use the sections below to indicate your views and provide comments on each proposal –**

**Proposal 1 – Use of volunteers across all libraries**

Strongly support
  Tend to oppose  
 Tend to support
  Strongly oppose  
 No views either way
  Don't know

Comments:

**Proposal 2 – Transfer Greatstone Library to the Town Hall**

Strongly support
  Tend to oppose  
 Tend to support
  Strongly oppose  
 No views either way
  Don't know

Comments:

**7. Please use the box below to provide any other comments**

9

## Appendix B: Overview of Equality Impact Assessments

Potential negative impacts of initial budget proposals on certain services for some groups of service users have been identified, in particular, people from B.M.E. communities, disabled people, older people and women. The programme of consultation, resulting feedback and work with partners and providers has identified shared responses to mitigate risk and improve services and in some areas, initial proposals have been amended.

Name of E.I.A.	Contact person	Key Protected Groups likely to be affected/ experience adverse impact	Mitigation planned or risk
Use of volunteers across all libraries	Sarah Curran	Age, disability, gender and race	<p><b>Risks:</b>            Reduction in quality of service to vulnerable groups.            Negative response to the proposal from current users of the service.            Volunteer expenses.</p> <p><b>Mitigation:</b>            The libraries will remain open and all the services currently offered will be maintained, either by Council staff or volunteers.            Consultation feedback has identified some areas where we need to manage the risk. This has resulted in a proposal for additional Council staff being retained at Urmston library            Volunteers will be required to undergo a CRB check to ensure they comply with Council safeguards.            Volunteers will undergo a training programme that will enable them to deliver library services such as shelving items returned to the library, reserving items for customers, dealing with customer's library accounts, booking customers onto People's Network computers, assisting with photocopier and printing.            We will ensure that volunteers reflect the community, particularly with regard to language and culture. There will be opportunities for those who would benefit from the experience of volunteering, such as young people.            We will be working with Pulse Regeneration to recruit volunteers and support staff. They will be assisting the council to provide value-added services to local residents and communities that respond to local need.            Volunteers will be monitored to ensure an</p>

			acceptable standard is maintained
Transfer Greatstone library to the Town Hall	Sarah Curran	Age and disability	<p><b>Risks:</b>  Reduced hours of the Town Hall Library compared to Greatstone  Location of Town Hall Library</p> <p><b>Mitigation:</b>  Analysis of usage of Greatstone Library shows that 72% of items were issued between 9-5pm which will be the opening hours of the Town Hall Library.  For people who wish to access a library outside of these hours Stretford Library is 1.33 miles away and Old Trafford 1.7 miles  There will be Customer Service Advisors at the Town Hall Library which will give greater accessibility to council services and advice than is the case at Greatstone  There will be access to People's Network computers and printing/ photocopying facilities  The Town Hall Library is less than 1/3 of a mile from the current Greatstone Library.  We will ensure there is sufficient signposting to the new library.</p>